

**PROCEEDING FOR CANTONMENT SPECIAL BOARD
MEETING HELD ON 17/06/2019 AT 1600 HOURS IN THE OFFICE
OF THE CANTONMENT BOARD, AHMEDNAGAR**

PRESENT MEMBERS

Sr. No.	Name of Members	Designation
01.	Brig. Natarajan S, Cdr. SOTT, ACC & S	President Cantonment Board (PCB)
02.	Shri. B. S. Shrivastava, CEO	Member Secretary
03.	Smt. Meena Suresh Mehtani	Elected Member
04.	Shri. Shaikh Kalim Rafique	Elected Member
05.	Shri. Ravindra Shankar Lalbondre	Elected Member
06.	Smt. Shubhangi Ganesh Sathe	Elected Member
07.	Shri. Prakash Devram Fulari	Elected Member
08.	Shri. Sanjay Baburao Chhajlani	Elected Member

ABSENT MEMBERS

Sr. No.	Name of Members	Designation
01.	Shri. Musadik Sayyed Abdul Rahim Alias Musa Sadik	Vice-President
02.	Brig. KR Rathi, SEMO & HO	Ex-Officio Member
03.	Col. OP Sharma, Adm. Comdt. Stn, HQ	Nominated Member
04.	Lt. Col. RS Yadav, OIC, ECHS, C/o, Stn HQrs,	Nominated Member
05.	Shri. Prashant Sumantrao Patil, Adll. District Magistrate	Nominated Member
06.	Shri. Paras Maisheri, IDES, GE(N)	Ex-Officio Member

SR.

NO. SUBJECT

**01. BUDGET ESTIMATES FOR THE YEAR 2019-2020 (REVISED)
AND FOR THE YEAR 2020-2021 (ORIGINAL)**

To note and approve the Budget Estimates prepared under Rule 17 of the Cantonment Account Code, 1924 for the year 2019-

2020 (Revised) & 2020-2021 (Original). The Budget Estimates along-with all relevant papers are placed on the table.

RESOLUTION

CEO read out the Budget Estimates provision made in the year 2019-2020 (Revised) & 2020-2021 (Original). Discussed at length and approved the Budget Estimates unanimously.

Further noted that unclaimed balance deposit shown in deposit register beyond three years be transferred to Cantonment Fund Account u/s 78(2) of Cantonments Account Code 1924.

02. PROVIDING OUTSOURCED CONSERVANCY SERVICES TO STATION HEADQUARTER, AHMEDNAGAR.

To consider and approve outsourcing of conservancy services to Station Headquarter, Ahmednagar. A letter No. 617/4Q4(OC) 2019-20 dated 7th June 2019 received from Station Headquarter, Ahmednagar requesting for provide conservancy services i.e. supply of 86 contractual Safaikarmacharis and four nos. of tipper vehicles along with regular conservancy services i.e. 04 nos of vehicles and 16 nos of regular conservancy Safaikarmacharis. Station Headquarter, Ahmednagar has received sanction of Rs. 3,44,33,064/- for the said services for FY 2018-19 from GOC in C, Southern Command, Pune. Cantonment Board can provide the above services through outsourcing as per instructions issued vide Govt. of India, Ministry of Defence letter No. 6(2)/2011/D (Q&C) dated 29th December 2017. Budget provision will be made in Budget Estimate (Revised) 2019-20 accordingly.

All relevant papers are placed on the table.

RESOLUTION

Considered, discussed in detail and resolved to approve. Necessary Budget provision be made in 2019-20 (Revised) and 2020-21 (Original). The Board further resolved that requirement of manpower for Cantonment Board outsourcing services can be taken from the same agency.

03. ANNUAL CONTRACT FOR DOOR TO DOOR GARBAGE COLLECTION IN AHMEDNAGAR CANTONMENT

To consider and approve tenders for door to door garbage collection in Ahmednagar Cantonment. Online tenders for door to door garbage collection in Ahmednagar Cantonment were called through Government e-procurement website vide tender ID 2019_DGDE_467499_1. In response to the tender notice four tenders were received in stipulated time period. The technical bid of all four tenders have been opened and same technically evaluated by the committee and as per technical evaluation one firm has been rejected due to non submission of required documents and remaining three firms have been accepted to open financial bid. The details of tenders accepted for financial bid opening is as under :-

Sr. No.	Name of Contractor	Amount Quoted for per vehicle per month	Amount for four vehicles per month	Bid Rank
01.	Swayambhu Transport, Pune	Rs. 69,200/-	Rs. 2,76,800/-	L-2
02.	Global India Services, Pune	Rs. 68,500/-	Rs. 2,74,000/-	L-1
03.	J.K. Tourist and Transport, Pune	Rs. 84,350/-	Rs. 3,37,400/-	L-3

The previous rate for door to door collection was Rs. 64,999/- per vehicle per month. For this year the estimated cost has been calculated which is Rs. 71,000/- per vehicle per month including all taxes as applicable except GST. Global Enterprises, Pune has quoted lowest rate of Rs. 68,500/- per vehicle per month including all taxes as applicable except GST.

All relevant papers are placed on the table.

RESOLUTION

Considered. Chief Executive Officer explained that as mentioned at Agenda side that the tender have been scrutinized by the technical evaluation committee. The Committee scrutinized the documents of all tenderers as per tender conditions correctly and submitted report that three firms are eligible to open financial bids.

Accordingly financial bids opened and found that the lowest rates i.e. Rs. 68,500/- per vehicle per month has been quoted by M/s Global India services, Pune.

The Board has given base price / estimated price of Rs. 71,000/- per vehicle per month in the tender notice and the lowest tenderer has quoted the rates of Rs. 68,500/- per vehicle per month below the base / estimated price. Chief Executive Officer also placed the statement showing trend of increase in contract rate every year which is between 10 to 12% every year and same has been approved by the Board and accordingly works were awarded to the successful contractors.

The lowest rates quoted also completed with last year's contract rate and found that there is increase of approximate 11%. It is also observed that the rates of labour, fuel, maintenance of vehicles have been increased equally hence the lowest rates quoted are reasonable. The work can't be done departmentally in absence of Vehicles and labour.

The matter discussed in detail. Some Elected Members objected regarding lowest rates obtained that the rates are at higher side President Cantonment Board directed all members to explained their views individually.

- 1) Smt. Meena Suresh Mehatani, Chairman, School Committee gave opinion that the tenders be called again and the work be carried out departmentally.
- 2) Smt. Shubhangi Ganesh Sathe, Chairman, Health Committee gave the opinion that the lowest quoted rates are reasonable considering previous years trend of increase. She also stated that it will be difficult to run door to door garbage collection departmentally in absence of sufficient staff and vehicles. She said that the lowest rates be approved in the interest of the Board and general public.
- 3) Shri. Shaikh Kalim Rafique, Chairaman, Finance Committee gave the opinion that the rates quoted by the M/s Global India Services are at higher side and the rates can not be accepted and there will be loss to the Board and extension be given to the present contractor to run the contract.

- 4) Shri. Ravindra Shankar Lalbondre, Elected Member offered no comment on tender process and stated that the interest of the Board should be taken in to consideration and tender be re-invited and work be carried departmentally.
- 5) Shri. Prakash Devram Fulari, Elected Member offered no comments on tender process and stated that the work may be carried departmentally.
- 6) Shri. Sanjay Baburao Chhajlani, Elected Member stated that the tenders be called again and work be carried departmentally.

After hearing opinion from all elected members and views of Chief Executive Officer, President Cantonment Board, considering the facts of increase of rates in comparison of previous years, present difficult situation of sanitation, explained by Chief Executive Officer and Chairman of Health Committee, coming rainy season and absence of sufficient staff and vehicles, PCB directed that the lowest rates quoted by M/s. Global India Services, Pune be approved in public interest. After discussion the Board resolved that the rates quoted by M/s Global India Services, Pune are approved. PCB further directed to CEO that all necessary document procedure be completed in this regard. In case the approved contractor does not agree to run the contract the necessary action be taken immediately.

04. E-TENDER FOR COLLECTION OF VEHICLE ENTRY TAX

Ref. Special CBR. No. 01 dated 12/04/2019.

To consider and approve e-tenders invited vide Notice Inviting Tender No. ANR/RB/T-1/VET/2019-20 dated 18/04/2019, wide publicity given in National as well as Local Newspaper and e-portal website.

In response to the advertisement 05 tenders were received in stipulated time period. After scrutiny of technical documents submitted by the tenderers 03 tenders were found eligible for financial bid opening. The technical scrutiny report was published on the e-portal on 14/06/2019 and the financial bids of the eligible tenderers were opened on 14/06/2019. The detailed comparative statement is mentioned as under :-

Sr. No.	Particulars	M/s Inderdeep Constructions, Ulhasnagar	M/s Khalatkar Constructions, Nagpur	M/s Balaji Enterprises, Ahmednagar
		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
01.	Collection of Vehicle Entry Tax from commercial Vehicles passing from the Cantonment limits	3,13,90,000/-	3,65,32,850/-	3,28,50,000/-

M/s Khalatkar Constructions, Nagpur has quoted the highest rate of Rs. 3,65,32,850/- for one year. Last year's contractual amount was Rs. 2,80,19,955/-.

RESOLUTION

Considered and discussed in detail. CEO explained that at present VET collection is being done departmentally and the details of collection of VET amount per day was shown to the Board. PCB appreciated the work being done by Cantonment Board staff engaged for VET collection. CEO explained to the Board that a letter dated 17/6/2019 has been received from Adv. Shri. Vijaykumar B. Sapkal that present petitioner M/s Saudagar Agency has filed writ petition before Hon'ble High Court Bombay Bench at Aurangabad, CEO further stated that in this connection Shri Datta Nagode, Adv. Senior Panel Counsel for Union of India, High Court Aurangabad vide letter dated 17/06/2019 intimated that M/s Saudagar Agencies has filed writ petition before the Hon'ble High Court Bench at Aurangabad on 17/06/2019. Adv. Datta Nagode has also intimated that the matter is kept for hearing on 19/06/2019 before the Hon'ble High Court. The letter given by Adv. Datta Nagode was read out by Chief Executive Officer before the Board, where in the opinion was given that there is no stay granted by the Hon'ble High Court in favour of the petitioner till this date and decision may be taken as per decision of the Board

but Board may not issue the work order till the orders of Hon'ble High Court in writ petition.

The matter was discussed at length, considering the present situation the Board resolved that the Vehicle Entry Tax functioning departmentally be continued till the decision of Hon'ble High Court in the writ petition. The Board further resolved that necessary steps be taken immediately after receipt of Order of Hon'ble High Court.

Sd/-XXX
CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER
MEMBER SECRETARY
(B. S. SHRIVASTAVA)

Sd/-XXX
PRESIDENT
AHMEDNAGAR CANTONMENT BOARD
(BRIG. NATARAJAN S)

Dated 17/06/2019